

Document of
The World Bank

FOR OFFICIAL USE ONLY

Report No.: 17981

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

REPUBLIC OF COTE D'IVOIRE

**HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT SUPPORT
PROJECT
(Credit 2505-IVC)**

June 8, 1998

Human Development III
Africa Region

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

CURRENCY EQUIVALENTS

Currency Unit = CFA franc (CFAF)

The CFAF is tied to the French Franc (FF) in the ratio of FF 1 to CFAF 100 following the January 12, 1994 devaluation of the CFAF from a ratio of FF 1 to CFAF 50. The French Franc is currently floating.

1993	US\$ = 270 CFA francs
1994	US\$ = 470 CFA francs
1995	US\$ = 490 CFA francs
1996	US\$ = 550 CFA francs
1997	US\$ = 590 CFA francs

1993	CFAF 1 million = US\$3,703.70
1994	CFAF 1 million = US\$2,127.66
1995	CFAF 1 million = US\$2,040.82
1996	CFAF 1 million = US\$1,818.18
1997	CFAF 1 million = US\$1,694.92

SDR 1 = US\$1.34442 (February 1998)

WEIGHTS AND MEASURES

Metric System

FISCAL YEAR OF BORROWER

January 1 - December 30

ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS

AfDB	African Development Bank
COPVRH	HRMD Operating Committee
CPPR	Country Portfolio Performance Review
DCGTx	General Directorate for Major Projects
EPF	Economic Policy Framework
ESAF	Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility
EU	European Union
HIPC	Highly Indebted Poor Countries Initiative
HRMD	Human Resources Development Project
HRDMP	Human Resources Development Management Support Project
IBRD	International Bank for Reconstruction and Development
IDA	International Development Association
IMF	International Monetary Fund
LIL	Learning and Innovation Loan
MEF	Ministry of Economy and Finance
MENFB	Ministry of National Education and Basic Training
MESRIT	Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research
METFP	Ministry of Technical Education and Professional Training
MSP	Ministry of Public Health
MTR	Mid-term Review
PAGE	Economic Management Support Project
PDSSI	Integrated Health Services Development Project
PFP	Policy Framework Paper
PNDEF	National Education and Training Development Program
PNDS	National Health Development Project
SA	Special Account
TA	Technical Assistance

Vice President:	Jean-Louis Sarbib
Director:	Theodore Ahlers
Sector Manager:	Helena Ribe
Task Team Leader:	Catherine Laurent

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

REPUBLIC OF COTE D'IVOIRE

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT SUPPORT
PROJECT

(Credit 2505-IVC)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE

EVALUATION SUMMARY	i
PART I: PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION	1
1. INTRODUCTION	1
A. Macro-economic Situation and Country Assistance Strategy	1
B. Bank's Role in the Health and Education Sectors.....	2
2. HRMDP OBJECTIVES	3
A. Initial Objectives of the HRMD Project.....	3
B. Description and Project Components.....	4
C. Legal Covenants and Special Agreements	4
D. Evaluation of the HRMD Project Objectives.....	4
3. PROJECT EXECUTION AND RESULTS	5
A. Evaluation of Project's Success and Sustainability	5
B. Summary of Project Costs and Financing Arrangements.	7
C. Project Implementation Schedule	8
D. Analysis of Key Factors Affecting Project Objectives	8
E. Evaluation of the Borrower's and the Bank's Performance.....	9
F. Evaluation of Project's Results.....	9
4. SYNTHESIS OF PRINCIPLE CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE OPERATIONS	10
A. Principle Lessons of Project Execution	10
B. Future Operations and Sustainability	10
C. Lessons for Future Projects in Côte d'Ivoire	10
PART II: STATISTICAL ANNEXES	12
Table 1: Summary of Assessments	13
Table 2: Related Bank Loans/Credits	14
Table 3: Project Timetable.....	15
Table 4: Loan/Credit Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual	15
Table 5: Performance Indicators for Annual Review	16
Table 6: Studies Included in the Project	18
Table 7 (A) Project Costs and (B) Financing.....	26
Table 8: Status of Legal Covenants	27
Table 9: Bank Resources: Staff Inputs.....	28
Table 10: Bank Resources: Missions.....	29

- Appendices:** A. Completion Mission's Aide-Mémoire
B. Summary of the Government's Report

This document has a restricted distribution and may be used by recipients only in the performance of their official duties. Its contents may not otherwise be disclosed without World Bank authorization.

Implementation Completion Report
Republic of Côte d'Ivoire
Human Resources Development Management Support Project
(Credit 2505-IVC)

Preface

This is the Implementation Completion Report (ICR) for the Human Resources Development Management Project in the Republic of Côte d'Ivoire, for which credit 2505-IVC in the amount of US\$6.7 million (SDR 4.7 million equivalent) was approved on June 1, 1993, and made effective on December 22, 1993.

The credit was closed on December 31, 1997, compared with the original closing date of December 31, 1996. Final disbursement took place on May 20, 1998, at which time a balance of US\$159,523.22 was canceled.

The ICR was prepared by Catherine Laurent of the Africa Region, with assistance from Ross Pfile, and reviewed by Helena Ribe, Sector Manager of AFTH3, and Jérôme Chevallier, Technical Manager, AFTS3. The Borrower provided comments on the draft report, which have been addressed in the final version.

Preparation of this ICR was begun during the Bank's final supervision/completion mission in December 1997. During this mission, interested parties attended an in-country workshop at which project outcome was discussed in depth. At the time of the Mid-term Review, discussions were also held on the status of implementation and finalization of the project, the use of pre-investment funds, the appointment of a ministerial coordinator, and an action plan to aid in the successful completion of the project. As is evidenced, the project greatly benefited from the Borrower's participation at preparation, and throughout the life of the project. The project also benefited from an average of two supervision missions per year during its implementation.

The report is based upon material in the project file. The Borrower provided its own evaluation of the project, a summary of which can be found in the Appendices. The complete report is available upon request from the African Information Services Center.

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

REPUBLIC OF COTE D'IVOIRE

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT SUPPORT PROJECT (Credit 2505-IVC)

EVALUATION SUMMARY

1. **Introduction.** The Bank's involvement in the education sector in Côte d'Ivoire ended in 1986 with the closing of the third education credit, and until the recently negotiated (April 1998) Basic Education Project had remained absent from investments in the sector. The Bank's first health project closed in 1994, and the second investment in the sector (Integrated Health Services Development Project--PDSSI, Credit 2983-IVC) which was approved in June 1996, was placed in the "at risk" category in June 1997 because of poor project management and non-completion of the 1997 work plan. Previous experience in the country has shown the importance of including the Ivorians as early as project preparation, in order to overcome a lack of commitment to, and internalization of, the adjustment process within the administration.

2. **Project Objectives.** The HRDMP, to ensure a complementarity with its companion project, the Economic Management Support Project (PAGE), was conceived to strengthen the management capacities of the social ministries to implement the operational strategies developed in the scope of the HRMD. The project aimed at increasing the competency level in the health and education sector ministries, and included four components designed to strengthen the capacity of these social ministries to:

- (a) prepare and defend operating and investment budgets which ensure the quality of basic social services;
- (b) monitor and evaluate the services rendered, as well as the impact of reforms with a view to future reforms;
- (c) promote improvements in the quality of education and the management of primary schools, in order to increase the level of learning, adaptation of education, and the link between the cost-effectiveness of services; and
- (d) support project management and the monitoring of technological transfers, as well as create a pre-investment study fund which would finance the collection and analysis of information and other studies to be identified.

3. **Implementation Experience and Results.** At Project onset, the objectives may have appeared ambitious because (i) management was not part of the ministries' culture, and (ii) the Technical Assistance design placed great demands upon the beneficiaries. However, the Project can be said to have fulfilled its objectives; the beneficiary ministries made enormous progress in management and activity planning, as well as in accepting to consult current and

future users. The Ministry of Public Health (MSP) and the Ministry of Higher Education and Technological Innovation (MESRIT) were also able to prepare fundamental reforms which improved services rendered, and the Ministry of National Education and Basic Training (MENFB) is not far behind. Overall, Project outcome can be rated as “satisfactory”.

4. The Credit was originally approved for US\$6.7 million. The total amount disbursed was US\$6,551,495.03, and US\$159,523.22 was canceled. Government counterpart funds totaled US\$1.2 million equivalent. While the project was initially negotiated in August 1992, it was not approved until 10 months later, June 1993, due to a strained relationship between the Borrower and the Bank (CFAF parity problem). Following effectiveness, the Project took another two years to find its implementation pace. However, it also suffered from weaknesses such as fulfilling requests for Special Account (SA) replenishments, and problems with counterpart funding. As a consequence, the Project was still classified as a “problem project” in the beginning of 1996. The Project was originally foreseen to close on December 31, 1996, but was given a one-year extension, and closed on December 31, 1997.

5. The greatest challenge to project objectives was the interministerial implementation of the Project: management was undertaken by the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF), with use of Project services by three and then four different departments and autonomous public institutions. The President’s Report foresaw two additional risks: the quality of the advice and training offered; and the commitment of the Ivorian administration to put the achievements of the Project into use.

6. In spite of some delay in Project start-up, the Borrower’s performance was satisfactory, considering the Project management and the execution of Project activities. However, the Borrower’s performance is less satisfactory if counterpart funding is taken into consideration, given that funds were consistently late, sometimes by more than a year. The Bank’s performance was also satisfactory, notwithstanding changes in personnel and certain delays in reaction time for procurement. The Bank’s response to changes in the country situation demonstrated flexibility and understanding which led to the overall successful implementation of the project.

7. **Summary of Findings, Future Operations, and Key Lessons Learned.** On a positive note, the technical assistance provided to the ministries helped to develop and implement important reforms and to institute a real monitoring, programming, and resource management capacity, while improving their use. The units responsible have proven to be creative and have taken the initiative to use the pre-investment funds which were very flexible. The interministerial management under the aegis of the MEF, which was originally seen to be a potential hindrance, has proven to be an asset: it ensured as smooth as possible access to all components which were placed in neutral territory. One negative aspect, other than the frequent change of directors, was the absence of an Implementation Manual.

8. In the health sector, the implementation of the management capacity at the MSP, as well as the cost-recovery system, have laid the groundwork for the development of a primary health care strategy in the scope of the PDSSI. In the education sector, discussions held with the Bank and the other partners led to the adoption of the National Education and Training Development Program (PNDEF), and a Basic Education Project was recently negotiated (April 1998) by the Bank, with Government participation, which should permit, through

better planning and programming of human and financial resources in the MENFB, both improved efficiency and expansion of the system to the benefit of poor children.

9. It will be necessary to continue to support the modernization and improvement of the Government's tools and management and programming procedures. The institutional budgets exist, if their directors are interested.

10. All future interventions in these sectors must be assured of a complete understanding, by the ministries' teams, of the stakes and the objectives. If they must include interministerial cooperation, it is essential that the management and coordination team be in a position to inform any newcomer and to motivate its partners in the other ministries. Future interventions can resort to national and international expertise as long as expected results and penalties are clearly defined, with a schedule of stages and details of responsibility included in the terms of reference.

11. Future interventions must also pay close attention to the capacities of the ministries and units who will be responsible for overall Project implementation. These actors must be given the tools necessary at the onset of the Project. In this instance, the lack of an Implementation Manual at the beginning of the project hindered its early implementation. Future project design must take into account the fact that technical assistance is not the correct means to address quality issues in basic service delivery. In this instance, quality issues of the *écoles témoins* would have been addressed via a Learning and Innovation Loan (LIL), if this lending instrument had existed at the time of project preparation/appraisal. Future projects in the social sectors must also take into consideration the impact of the HIPC.

12. The following specific lessons can be drawn from the overall success of this project:

- Project design must take into account the presence of qualified personnel in the civil service who only need to undertake training in order to update their skills. As a result, less expatriate consultation than originally foreseen was used because the expertise/capacity required was found in-country.
- In this Project, the fact that the TA was not permanent led to a real transfer of knowledge throughout Project life.
- Clear understanding with the Borrower that expert intervention would only take place upon completion of specific tasks, and that sanctions would be made if these tasks were not completed as agreed.
- Flexibility on the part of the Bank aided in Project success; consistent actions have been retained in future operations.
- Future operations can build upon the TA experience gained through this Project, thereby allowing for a consistent Bank's strategy in the sector.

IMPLEMENTATION COMPLETION REPORT

REPUBLIC OF COTE D'IVOIRE

HUMAN RESOURCES DEVELOPMENT MANAGEMENT SUPPORT PROJECT (Credit 2505-IVC)

PART I: PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION EVALUATION

1. INTRODUCTION

1. In June 1993, Credit 2505-IVC for US\$6.7 million (SDR 4.7 million equivalent) was approved by the Board, with Credit effectiveness taking place in December 1993.

2. This Implementation Completion Report examines the Human Resources Development Management Support Project (HRDMP) from both the Bank's (Part I and II) and Borrower's (Annex B) perspectives. Statistical information can be found in Part II. The report is based on the President's Report, documents found in the Bank's files, data received from the Borrower, and discussions with Bank and Government representatives.

A. MACRO-ECONOMIC SITUATION AND COUNTRY ASSISTANCE STRATEGY

3. In January 1994, with the CFAF devaluation, the Government began to re-evaluate its medium-term adjustment program. The 1994 adjustment program was supported by the IMF in the form of an Enhanced Structural Adjustment Facility (ESAF) and through an IDA credit. A new Economic Policy Framework (EPF) was approved in 1995, and a meeting of the Côte d'Ivoire Consultative Group took place in June 1995. Côte d'Ivoire recently approved a substantial reform program: elimination of nearly all the non-tariff barriers and price controls, a decrease in customs tariffs, privatization of 37 enterprises, increased competition, and modernization of the labor and investment codes. This policy, coupled with confronting their debt problem, has allowed the country to grow.

4. The priorities of the strategy proposed by IDA until the end of FY2000 are to assist the Government in reaching overall and sustainable growth. The primary objective of the strategy is poverty reduction, thanks to: (a) continued macro-economic policy which ensures stability--notably through debt management and solid legislative and regulatory frameworks; (b) development of the private sector and private investment; (c) more effective, monitored, and innovative use of expenditures in the health, education, and infrastructure sectors; (d)

strengthening of human and institutional capacities; and (e) management which ensures sustainability of the environment. To assist this strategy, the Bank has agreed to support credits for projects in the agriculture and land tenure, transport, energy, urbanization, education, health, and population sectors.

B. BANK'S ROLE IN THE HEALTH AND EDUCATION SECTORS

5. **Education investments.** IBRD approved three education credits in the 1970s, with the last in 1979. Implementation, however, was unsatisfactory. These projects essentially consisted of creating institutions for initial teacher training and technical and professional training. At the end of the period, a less assertive approach appears to have been taken because of (a) the high cost of implementing the reform and the lack of national consensus; and (b) the weaknesses in the system, most notably its excessively high cost, weak internal and external effectiveness, and a deficient administration, which was not taken into account in any of the projects. There was no further agreement with Côte d'Ivoire on the diagnosis and following the close of the third education credit in 1986, IBRD was absent from investments in the sector. A Basic Education Project was negotiated in April 1998, with Board presentation in June 1998.

6. **Health sector investments.** A first health project (for an amount of US\$22.2 million equivalent) was approved in 1985 and closed in 1994. Its objectives were to improve nurses' training, sector management, and direct the 1988 population census, and its outcome was rated satisfactory. This project also had an overlap of thirty months with the HRMD. An Integrated Health Services Development Project (PDSSI, Credit 2983-IVC) was approved in June 1996 for an amount of US\$40 million equivalent to support the National Health Development Program (PNDS). It places priority on the minimum package of activities. The project was placed in the "at risk" category in June 1997 because of poor project management and non-completion of the 1997 work plan.

7. **Sectoral adjustment.** The HRMD was approved in 1991, but the devaluation of the CFAF led to a restructuring of the initially approved credit. A total of US\$236 million was loaned by IBRD and IDA, with an additional US\$130 million from Germany, AfDB, and the EU. The primary objective of the HRMD was to correct the unfavorable conditions revealed by the basic social indicators, notably life expectancy, infant mortality, and primary education enrollment, which placed the country's development efforts in jeopardy. To achieve these objectives, the quality of public health and education services had to be improved, especially at the primary level. The HRMD brought budgetary support to the following areas: (a) monitoring of budgets and effectiveness of programs in the human resources sector; (b) official adoption of a human resources development policy; (c) improvement of financial sustainability and introduction of cost recovery in the health and training institutions with monitoring of social transfers which favor secondary and higher education students; and (d) improved implementation capacity through better management and monitoring tools. The outcome of the HRMD are mixed (ICR no. 14841): budgetary

resources for the primary level decreased when they should have increased; cost recovery was established, as well as the monitoring of the social transfers; the unit costs for education were greatly reduced, particularly at the higher education level, where the number of students doubled without the benefit of accompanying budget increases.

8. **Technical assistance.** IBRD financed a technical assistance project (Technical Assistance Project, Loan 2509-IVC) from 1981 to 1988. This experience showed the importance of including the Ivorians as early as project preparation, as they will be ultimately responsible for implementation, as well as the necessity of placing importance on long-term capacity building. The Project Completion Report (PCR) (December 1989) concluded that these objectives failed, largely because of a lack of commitment to, and internalization of, the adjustment process within the administration. Finally, the PCR underlined the fact that the project did not address the long-term institutional development problems.

2. HRDMP OBJECTIVES

9. The HRDMP, a technical assistance project, was conceived to strengthen the management capacities of the social ministries to implement the operational strategies developed in the scope of the HRMD. The project was designed to ensure a complementarity with the Economic Management Support Project (PAGE) which would strengthen the capacity of the Ministries of Economy and Finance, Civil Service and Employment, and Justice to implement the ongoing macro-economic reforms, which preceded the HRDMP by a few months, and is nearing completion. The HRDMP was prepared in a participatory manner, under the aegis of the HRMD operating committee (COPVRH).

A. INITIAL OBJECTIVES OF THE HRDMP

10. The project aimed at increasing the competency level in the health and education sector ministries: Ministry of Public Health and Social Affairs which became the Ministry of Public Health (MSP), the Ministry of Basic Education which became the Ministry of National Education and Basic Training (MENFB), the Ministry of Technical Education and Professional Training (METFP) which was recreated in March 1996, and the Ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research which became the Ministry of Higher Education and Technological Innovation (MESRIT). According to the May 1993 President's Report, the overall objective was to provide high-level technical assistance, with the goal of giving on-site training and ensuring a knowledge transfer to local representatives. The project concentrated on the following two areas: strengthening the work methods and planning, programming, budgetary, monitoring, evaluation systems, and strengthening the capacity to promote the quality and greater access to education and health, principally at the primary level.

B. DESCRIPTION AND PROJECT COMPONENTS

11. The project included four components designed to strengthen the capacity of the social ministries:

- (a) prepare and defend operating and investment budgets which ensure the quality of basic social services;
- (b) monitor and evaluate the services rendered as well as the impact of reforms with a view to future reforms;
- (c) promote improvements in the quality of education and the management of primary schools, in order to increase the level of learning, adaptation of education, and the link between the cost-effectiveness of services; and
- (d) support project management and the monitoring of technological transfers, as well as create a pre-investment study fund which would finance the collection and analysis of information and other studies to be identified.

C. LEGAL COVENANTS AND SPECIAL AGREEMENTS

12. In addition to the general conditions, the following actions had to be undertaken in order to enter into credit effectiveness:

- (a) selection, through competition, of consultants for Components 1 and 2;
- (b) selection of a technical advisor for Component 3;
- (c) appointment of a national coordinator for Component 3;
- (d) selection of a technical advisor in the COPVRH for technology transfers; and
- (e) deposit of CFAF 75 million in a Project Account opened in a commercial bank acceptable to IDA.

13. A reallocation of funds between project categories took place in January 1996, with a second reallocation in September 1997. Additionally, the initial amount of the Special Account (SA) was increased in December 1995.

D. EVALUATION OF THE HRDMP OBJECTIVES

14. The project objectives may have appeared ambitious at project onset because (a) management was not part of the ministries' culture, and (b) the Technical Assistance design placed great demands upon the beneficiaries. One objective which did not appear at project appraisal was the contribution to poverty reduction. In fact, a poverty study for Côte d'Ivoire

became necessary after the CFAF devaluation, because the Borrower became eligible for IDA funds. The country's surveys and report were financed through the HRDMP.

3. PROJECT EXECUTION AND RESULTS

A. EVALUATION OF PROJECT SUCCESS AND SUSTAINABILITY

15. **Benefits.** According to the President's Report, the project had one primary benefit: create the capacity in the Government to promote better service in the health and education sectors, at the health facility and school level, as well as at the central level. While there is evidence of creation or strengthening at the central level, the impact on service delivery can only be seen in the *écoles témoins*.

16. **Component 1.** *Prepare and defend operating and investment budgets which would permit basic services to perform adequately.* In order to achieve full implementation of this component, four specific areas received support under the project:

- Consultant services implemented at the beginning of the project allowed for initial computerization of monitoring and programming of human and financial resources in the beneficiary ministries. Late and three-phased provision of computer equipment completed the technology transfer activities of this component.
- With regard to personnel issues, the MENFB, in synergy with the *Coopération française's* PARMEN project (Ministry of National Education Reform Support Project) allowed for the creation of a real personnel management capacity (computerized personnel files, etc.), a vast undertaking in a department which represents more than half the civil service. The national public service management reform, under the aegis of the PAGE, was built upon the MENFB experience, with the collaboration of the ministry responsible for public service.
- Budgetary nomenclature reform under the aegis of PAGE benefited from the experience of the MSP supported by the HRDMP. The decentralization of financial resources to the regional directorates of the MENFB was also implemented thanks to the project. The budget estimates capacity at the ministerial level is finally recognized and fully utilized by the MEF for macro-economic conditionalities which favor the social sectors included in the PFP and the HIPC matrices. Therefore, the budget allocations and estimates for 1998-2000 have been significantly increased in the social sectors.
- Technical assistance furnished through the project allowed the MSP to implement a cost-recovery system within the timeframe given in the HRMD.

17. **Component 2.** *Monitor and evaluate service delivery and the impact of policy actions as a basis for further strategic development.* The primary beneficiary ministries were the MSP (surveys of primary health care beneficiaries) and the MESRIT for their semi-annual student surveys, as well as sub-sector development. The MENFB was able to undertake follow-up studies, notably of cohorts, and observations of the first year of primary education. But this component essentially was used in the quality of life (poverty) survey and its acceptance by the Ivorians contributed significantly to the development and acceptance of the Bank's support strategy.

18. **Component 3.** *Promote quality improvements in instruction and school-management with the aim of increasing student learning, the relevance of education and the cost-effectiveness of service delivery.* The *écoles témoins* component worked effectively and successfully, but remained outside the normal activities of the MENFB until 1996. In the beginning, 10 schools, one per administrative region, volunteered to participate in the experiment and the diffusion of the initiatives taken at the school level to improve the quality of education and learning. After the Mid-term Review (MTR), the number was expanded to 60 (6 per region). The results show an increase of 27 percent in admissions to junior secondary school. Two major success factors in the component were: (i) the financial management was independent of the MENFB, thus the crucial logistical support, given the dispersion of the schools, was provided without delays, and (ii) continuity with the technical advisor, while the coordinator remained throughout the entire project.

19. **Component 4.** *Support for project management and for monitoring the transfer of technology, as well as a pre-investment fund to finance information collection and analysis and periodic studies to be identified.*

- *Project management support sub-component:* the project management unit (administrator, accountant, and drivers) was situated within the COPVRH, at the MEF. It was responsible for financing operating costs of all project activities, regardless of the beneficiary. The General Directorate for Major Projects (DCGTx) provided technical support, primarily for the bidding process (consultants and computer equipment).
- *Monitoring of technology transfer sub-component:* the project introduced a new technical assistance method, which was more demanding, and thus more difficult to implement and monitor than permanent support. This new method was designed and implemented through alternating intervention phases of on-site technology internalization without expert presence; final verification of the results by experts took place before the next step of the transfer. The Government designated an advisor, the project administrator, who, in turn, designated at least one counterpart per ministry in order to ensure monitoring of the transfers. Day-to-day monitoring was the responsibility of the central administrative directors.
- *Pre-investment fund sub-component:* (see Part II, Table 6) the three departments responsible for education now benefit from a real programming and reform capacity. It

was also used to conduct studies for future investments in the education sector. The MSP did not solicit access to these funds, as it was benefiting from other funding for the PDSSI preparation.

(a) *higher education*: as a continuation of the reform and management improvements in the system initiated under the HRMD, the MESRIT was able to: establish Universities in Daloa and Korgho; reform the elitist tertiary schools and transform them into a single institution; prepare, disseminate, discuss, and implement the degree program reform; privatize management of some university restaurants; and decentralize human and financial resources at the national public institute level

(b) *basic education*: establishment of a first decentralization of finance, personnel and school mapping management to the regional level

(c) *technical education and professional training*: (began late, as the METFP was re-created only a few months before credit closing), place the programming and budgeting activities within this department.

20. **Sustainability.** The technology transfer has succeeded since the capacity is used, although technical as well as technological improvement within the beneficiary services remains necessary. In the health sector, the cost-recovery system functions satisfactorily, and the improvements in planning and management capacity of the MSP contributed to the preparation of the PNDS. The support given to the ministry responsible for education led to the development of a National Education and Training Development Program (PNDEF), and the implementation of an analytical tool which allowed for an evaluation of internal efficiency at the primary and secondary levels and the impact of reforms. Finally, the success of the *écoles témoins* led the MENFB, in 1998, to increase to 600 the number of primary institutions and to create the same network for 180 junior secondary schools.

B. SUMMARY OF PROJECT COSTS AND FINANCING AGREEMENTS

21. Total project cost as estimated at evaluation was US\$7.9 million, excluding tax and duties, with US\$4.9 million (62%) in foreign currency. Base costs are expressed in June 1992 currency. Detailed project costs in local and foreign currencies can be found in Part II, table 7A.

22. Original project costs had to be revisited because of the CFAF devaluation and the extended life of the project: a reallocation of project funds between categories took place in January 1996, at about the same time as an increase of the initial amount in the SA; a second reallocation took place in September 1997. The IDA contribution was originally estimated at US\$6.7 million equivalent, with Government counterpart funds totaling US\$1.2 million equivalent. Estimated and actual costs are presented in Part II, table 7B.

C. PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION SCHEDULE

23. The project was identified in March, evaluated in June, and negotiated in August 1992. It was not approved until June 1, 1993 due to the strained relationship between the Borrower and the Bank (CFAF parity problem), and became effective on December 22, 1993. The CFAF devaluation in January 1994 primarily affected the Government's counterpart funding. The MTR took place in June 1995, and the credit was closed on December 31, 1997, after a one-year extension.

D. ANALYSIS OF KEY FACTORS AFFECTING PROJECT OBJECTIVES

24. The greatest challenge was the interministerial implementation of the project: management was undertaken by the Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF), with use of project services by three and then four different departments and autonomous public institutions. The President's Report foresaw two potential risks:

(a) *the quality of the advice and training offered.* The contracts with advisors and trainers were to include monitorable performance indicators, and the Government was to cancel any unsatisfactory contract. Contracts were executed satisfactorily, and none were canceled. In fact, the real risk in this area was the difficulty encountered by the management unit and the future beneficiaries to define the terms of reference and identify potential candidates, given the specifics of expertise required. It is interesting to note that more technical assistance was provided by nationals (62%) than was originally foreseen, which allowed for reduced costs and discovery of true local expertise.

(b) *commitment of the Ivorian administration to put the achievements of the project into use.* The Government commitment in the HRMD showed its interest in reforming key functions in the administration of human resources, and the project was to support this process. In fact, the management of the HRMD by the COPVRH within the MEF, was not an obstacle to the appropriation of the project by the beneficiary ministries, even if the interministerial committee never met. Actually, as the participants at the closing workshop pointed out, except in rare cases, the central administration directors concerned with the financial interventions of the project, did not show a great interest in the completed activities; the reason was their frequent turn-over, from project effectiveness through implementation. Interest was shown only within the directorates, which is advantageous for sustainability, as these employees are less frequently subject to changes.

E. EVALUATION OF THE BORROWER'S AND THE BANK'S PERFORMANCE

25. The lack of an Implementation Manual slowed disbursements during the first two years of the project. In spite of some delay in project start-up, the Borrower's performance was satisfactory, considering the project management and the execution of project activities. It took time for the team, which was unfamiliar with IDA procedures, to acquire experience, and only after the fulfillment of the HRMD conditionalities were they fully able to undertake their responsibilities. The payment method for technical assistance, based on services rendered (by tranches) was one of two major factors which slowed disbursements during the first year. The second was the ministerial restructuring in December 1993, which led to new central administration directors during the project start-up period. Finally, pre-investment study funds (US\$1.5 million) were not used by the ministries responsible for education until after the MTR in June 1995 because of the lack of previously established regulations. Ministerial changes in January 1996, which created a specific portfolio for technical and professional education, marginally affected project execution by adding new finance management, personnel, and planning structures to the previous beneficiaries. The Borrower's performance is less satisfactory if counterpart funding is taken into consideration, given that funds were consistently late, sometimes by more than a year, which placed payment to suppliers in jeopardy. A performance evaluation of the Borrower is given in Part II, table 5.

26. The Bank's performance was also satisfactory, notwithstanding changes in personnel (three task managers in four years), and certain delays in reaction time for procurement. The Bank's response to changes in the country situation demonstrated flexibility and understanding which led to the overall successful implementation of the project. One example of this flexibility was to name a co-task manager within the Resident Mission, who had full authority to respond to the Borrower's requests; another was to increase the initial amount of the SA.

F. EVALUATION OF PROJECT RESULTS

27. The project can be said to have fulfilled its objectives: the beneficiary ministries made enormous progress in management and activity planning, as well as in accepting to consult current and future users. The MSP and MESRIT were also able to prepare fundamental reforms which improved services rendered, and the MENFB is not far behind.

28. **Noteworthy changes.** The project took two years to find its implementation pace, as explained above. But it also suffered from weaknesses which were evident in each CPPR of the Côte d'Ivoire portfolio--essentially constant delays in fulfilling requests for SA replenishments at the administrative level, and problems with counterpart funding. As a consequence, the project was still classified as a "problem project" in the beginning of 1996.

4. SYNTHESIS OF PRINCIPAL CONCLUSIONS AND FUTURE OPERATIONS

A. PRINCIPAL LESSONS OF PROJECT EXECUTION

29. On a positive note, the technical assistance provided to the ministries helped to develop and implement important reforms and to institute a real monitoring, programming, and resource management capacity, while improving their use. The units responsible have proven to be creative and have taken the initiative to use the pre-investment funds which were very flexible. The interministerial management under the aegis of the MEF, which was originally seen to be a potential hindrance, has proven to be an advantage: it ensured as smooth as possible access to all components which were placed in neutral territory. One negative aspect, other than the frequent change of directors, was the absence of an Implementation Manual.

B. FUTURE OPERATIONS AND SUSTAINABILITY

30. In the health sector, the implementation of the management capacity at the MSP, as well as the cost-recovery system, have laid the groundwork for the development of a primary health care strategy in the scope of the PDSSI. In the education sector, discussions held with the Bank and the other partners led to the adoption of the PNDEF, and a Basic Education Project was recently negotiated (April 1998) by the Bank, with Government participation, which should permit, through better planning and programming of human and financial resources in the MENFB, both improved efficiency and expansion of the system to the benefit of poor children.

31. Overall, it will be necessary to continue to support the modernization and improvement of the Government's tools and management and programming procedures. The institutional budgets exists, if their directors are interested.

C. LESSONS FOR FUTURE PROJECTS IN CÔTE D'IVOIRE

32. All future interventions in these sectors must be assured of a complete understanding, by the ministries' teams, of the stakes and the objectives. If they must include interministerial cooperation, it is essential that the management and coordination team be in a position to inform any newcomer and to motivate its partners in the other ministries. Future interventions can resort to national and international expertise as long as expected results and

penalties are clearly defined, with a schedule of stages and details of responsibility included in the terms of reference.

33. Future interventions must also pay close attention to the capacities of the ministries and units who will be responsible for overall project implementation. These actors must be given the tools necessary at the onset of the project. In this instance, the lack of an Implementation Manual at the beginning of the project hindered its early implementation. Future project design must take into account the fact that technical assistance is not the correct means to address quality issues in basic service delivery. In this instance, quality issues of the *écoles témoins* would have been addressed via a LIL, if this lending instrument had existed at the time of project preparation/appraisal. Future projects in the social sectors must also take into consideration the impact of the HIPC.

34. The following specific lessons can be drawn from the overall success of this project:

- Project design must take into account the presence of qualified personnel in the civil service who only need to undertake training in order to update their skills. As a result, less expatriate consultation than originally foreseen was used because the expertise/capacity required was found in-country.
- In this project, the fact that the TA was not permanent led to a real transfer of knowledge throughout project life.
- Clear understanding with the Borrower that expert intervention would only take place upon completion of specific tasks, and that sanctions would be made if these tasks were not completed as agreed.
- Flexibility on the part of the Bank aided in project success; consistent actions have been retained in future operations.
- Future operations can build upon the TA experience gained through this project, thereby allowing for a consistent Bank's strategy in the sector.

PART II: STATISTICAL ANNEXES

Table 1:	Summary of Assessments
Table 2:	Related Bank Loans/Credits
Table 3:	Project Timetable
Table 4:	Loan/Credit Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual
Table 5:	Performance Indicators for Annual Review
Table 6:	Studies Included in the Project
Table 7A:	Project Costs
Table 7B:	Project Financing
Table 8:	Status of Legal Covenants
Table 9:	Bank Resources: Staff Inputs
Table 10:	Bank Resources: Missions

Table 1: Summary of Assessments

A. <u>Achievement of Objectives</u>	<u>Substantial</u>	<u>Partial</u>	<u>Negligible</u>	<u>Not applicable</u>
Macro Policies	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Sector Policies	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Financial Objectives	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Institutional Development	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Physical Objectives	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Poverty Reduction	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Gender Issues	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Other Social Objectives	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Environmental Objectives	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Public Sector Management	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Private Sector Development	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>
Other (specify)	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
B. <u>Project Sustainability</u>	<u>Likely</u>		<u>Unlikely</u>	<u>Uncertain</u>
	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
C. <u>Bank Performance</u>	<u>Highly Satisfactory</u>		<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>
Identification	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Preparation Assistance	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Appraisal	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Supervision	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
D. <u>Borrower Performance</u>	<u>Highly Satisfactory</u>		<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Deficient</u>
Preparation	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Implementation	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Covenant compliance	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
Operation (if applicable)	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>
E. <u>Assessment of Outcome</u>	<u>Highly Satisfactory</u>		<u>Satisfactory</u>	<u>Unsatisfactory</u>
	<input type="checkbox"/>		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>

Table 2: Related Bank Loans/Credits

Credit	Purpose	Year of approval	Status
<i>Preceding operations</i>			
<i>Following operations</i>			
(Cr. 2637-IVC) Labor Force Training	The Labor Force Training Support Project will finance a time-slice of an on-going Vocational Development Training Fund (FDFP) program, which will subsequently expand to include new client groups in the informal sector, where the largest portion of the target group is employed and growth is fastest. Its total cost of US\$19.5 million will include three major components: (a) training, retraining and apprenticeship; (b) training outreach support; and (c) labor market monitoring and analysis.	1994	Ongoing
(Cr. 2893-IVC) Integrated Health Services Development Project	The objectives of the Integrated Health Services Development Project, within the framework of the government's National Health Development Plan, are to: (1) expand access to health services and improve their utilization; (2) make health services available on a sustainable basis; and (3) improve the ability of the Ministry of Public Health (MSP) to analyze health problems, and to formulate, monitor and evaluate policies, strategies and programs.	1996	Ongoing
Basic Education Program	The project supports the sectoral strategy set out in the National Education and Training Development Plan (NETDP). Over the next four years, the program will (i) strengthen teaching at the primary and secondary levels; (ii) increase access to basic education; and (iii) strengthen management capacity within the education sector. The program would also strengthen the ties between schools and communities.		Approved by Board

Table 3: Project Timetable

Steps in Project Cycle	Date Planned	Date actual/ latest estimate
Identification (Executive Project Summary)		2/25/92
Appraisal	4/92	6/1/92
Negotiations		8/24-26/92
Letter of development policy (if applicable)		
Board presentation	9/92	6/93
Signing	10/12/92	6/14/93
Effectiveness	10/92	12/22/93
Project completion	12/31/96	12/31/97
Credit closing	4/30/97	4/30/98

Table 4: Credit Disbursements: Cumulative Estimated and Actual
(US\$ millions)

	FY1994	FY1995	FY1996	FY1997	FY1998
Appraisal estimate	1.55	2.95	4.37	4.74	
Actual	0.14	0.88	2.17	3.59	4.04
Actual as % of estimate	9%	29.8%	49.6%	75.7%	85.2%
Date of final disbursement					May 20, 1998

Table 5: Performance Indicators for Annual Review

Key performance indicators in President's Report	End Year One	End Year Two	End Year Three	Results Year Five
<p>Planning, Programming and Budgeting: The component would be considered a success if, at the end of implementation, ministry staff were regularly using new tool and work budgetary methods to articulate their ministry's needs and demonstrate the budgetary implications of strategic options and decisions in a rational manner; operating and budgetary norms which permit quality performance would be in place and generally known and understood through the human resources sector.</p>	<p>A coherence between the indicative budget plan (HRDP SECAL) developed for each sector and the actual 1994 operating and investment budgets submitted to the ministries of Finance and Planning will have been demonstrated; the models will have been used to demonstrate the impact of all revisions to the operating and investment budgets proposed throughout the 1993 budget year.</p>	<p>Operating and investment budget proposals submitted to the ministries of Finance and Planning for 1995 will have been prepared on the basis of the new system; personnel, operating cost and investment norms established during the HRDP will have been respected; budgetary models will have been used to demonstrate the impact of all revisions to the proposed budgets.</p>	<p>The use of budgetary tools and norms developed under the project and the HRDP will have become the accepted means for articulating the needs of the human resources ministries and demonstrating the impact of fiscal decision; the operating and investment budget for 1996 will have been prepared using the new system.</p>	<p>Completed</p>
<p>Budgetary Monitoring and Performance Evaluation: The component would be considered a success if: (a) for budget monitoring, at the end of the implementation period, ministry staff were routinely using the tools and systems set up under the project to monitor budget execution quarterly and modifying execution accordingly; and (b) for program performance, it had institutionalized regular Beneficiary Assessments of the performance of the health and education systems (beginning at the health center and school level) and were using these assessments to modify programs.</p>	<p>(a) A systematic review of 1992 actual operating and budgetary expenditures for all levels and geographic areas of the education and health systems will have been carried out by February 1993; actual expenditure data will have been reflected in the 1994 budgetary planning models;</p> <p>(b) Preparations of Beneficiary Assessments (preparation of surveys, texts, etc.) will have been finished at the beginning of the 1993-94 school year.</p>	<p>(a) Actual expenditure data for 1993 will have been available to human resources decision makers on a quarterly basis; actual budgetary expenditure will have been communicated to the central ministries on a quarterly basis;</p> <p>(b) Beneficiary assessments will have been carried out for primary health and primary and secondary education; the findings of the initial beneficiary assessments will have been disseminated within the MEN and MSPS and discussed at the level of the COP.</p>	<p>(a) Actual expenditure data for operating and investment budgets will be routinely collected and analyzed on a quarterly basis in the context of the following year's budget preparation process;</p> <p>(b) Follow-up beneficiary assessments will have been carried out; findings of the 1993 beneficiary assessments will have been well disseminated and analyzed in the context of continuing sector reform policy.</p>	<p>Completed</p> <p>Completed</p>

Table 5: Performance Indicators for Annual Review (cont'd)

Key performance indicators in President's Report	End Year One	End Year Two	End Year Three	Results Year Five
<p>Quality Schools Initiative: The component would be considered a success if, at the end of implementation, the demonstration schools' experience leads ministry staff to adopt modifications to existing central policies and strategies which focus on teacher and school quality and if the participatory process of resolving local quality issues was replicated.</p>	<p>At least 10 schools will have been selected as part of the school network; team members will be accomplishing tasks as per their job descriptions with working groups meeting on a regular basis; inspectors will be routinely involved in establishing the agenda for improving school performance (quality of teaching); initial findings will have been disseminated throughout the MEN and discussed at the level of the COP.</p>	<p>Experimental action programs will be in place dealing with key school-level issues such as girls' participation, grade repetition and dropout, teacher supervision, formative evaluation, the use of teaching materials, community participation in school finances, etc.; inspectors will be regularly supervising the application of these methods; results of studies undertaken in the schools will be disseminated throughout the MEN and the COP; they will be used by the COP to propose new policy initiatives and by the MEN to expand the program.</p>	<p>Education policy relating to school effectiveness and operational strategies will have been revised, reinforced or updated; at least 20 more inspectorates will have been integrated into the program.</p>	Completed
<p>Management Support and Pre-Investment Studies: (a) The technology transfer and training aspects of this Project would be considered a success if, at the end of Project implementation, ministry staff were able to use new tools, information and work methods to articulate their ministry's needs and justify their ministry's decision-making process, particularly in the context of requests for operating and investments resources;</p> <p>(b) the Pre-investment studies component would be considered a success if requests for funding are well justified in terms of sector priorities and well coordinated with human resource ministry personnel;</p> <p>(c) project management activities will be considered a success if IDA-specific implementation procedures such as procurement, disbursement, reporting and auditing are followed.</p>	<p>(a) Group/team work methods and training seminars aimed at increasing technology/skills transfer have been implemented; consultants hired under the project have been evaluated in accordance with performance criteria established in their contracts;</p> <p>(b) Requests for pre-investment funding have been analyzed and acted upon expeditiously;</p> <p>(c) Auditors will have been chosen for the 1993 fiscal year audit; all procurement actions will have been expeditiously executed.</p>	<p>(a) Human resource ministry staff are able to use analytical tools and methods developed during the first project year with only periodic support from consultants;</p> <p>(b) Requests for pre-investment funding have been analyzed and acted upon expeditiously;</p> <p>(c) The first year audit will have been completed and sent to IDA within four months of the end of fiscal year 1993; preparations for the 1994 audit will be underway.</p>	<p>(a) Human resource ministry staff are routinely using analytical tools and methods developed under the project;</p> <p>(b) The pre-investment fund is fully disbursed;</p> <p>(c) The second year audit will have been completed and sent to IDA within four months of the end of fiscal year 1994; preparations of the 1995 audit will be underway.</p>	Completed Completed Completed

Table 6: Studies Included in Project

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1997	Labor market study	Identify and define the priority labor markets according to the country's socio-economic context with the aim of improving the performance of the professional and technical training system.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.
1997	Inventory	Aims at establishing a precise inventory of the Technical and Professional Training facilities. It will be necessary to transfer to internal competencies, the ability to develop analyze and monitoring tools for the system which will allow for improving internal efficiency, and establishing reliable statistics on the system and its evolution.	Completed	Use of the recommendations to influence policies on pedagogical management, property, personnel, training systems, etc.
1997	Support to education statistics (Phase II)	Consolidation of the statistical information system developed under the September 1995-March 1996 phase.	Completed	DPES capacity is restored and considerably improved thanks to this support. The DPES now has the tools which permit it to communicate with the decision makers and partners in the MENFB, one month after school begins, the first overall data: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -production of information on enrollment; -more reliable enrollment statistics; -increased responsibility of the partners in the regional and departmental directorates of the MENFB.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1997	Support to education statistics (Phase II)	Follow-up and finalization of the activities begun during Phase II (March 1996-March 1997).	Completed	Availability of statistics for school years 1995-1996 and 1996-1997, as well as those for the preparation of 1997-1998. -Contribution to the preparation and evaluation of the PNDEF
1997	Evaluation of the patients' reactions to cost-recovery in the health sector	Beneficiary assessment of cost-recovery.	Completed	Use of essential medications, particularly EGD, and standardized treatments which have resulted in cost reductions for the patients. Health system efficiency.
1997	Study of professional integration	Undertake a study to identify the labor markets and define actual job descriptions. The study specifically aims at: -identifying employment characteristics of those actually in the position; -describing the training of those actually in the position; -measuring the appropriateness of the training vis-à-vis the position.	Completed	Taking into account the design of the training.
1997	Study tour for establishing African Virtual University (AVU) Project	Subregional study in Dakar on the AVU.	Completed	Participate in the AVU Project.
1997	OSIS/publication Study	Publications.	Completed	Attractive and practical publications containing different types of analysis and varied information.
1997	CP1 Observation Study	Create a data base to allow for cohort analysis and internal efficiency of education.	Completed	Obtained a data base. Statistics provide reliable information on school access. Survey of priority interventions.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1997	Diagnostic survey on the Private Education Sector	Favor growth of private education sector participation in the education and integration of youth into the professional milieu, not only through certification training, but through qualification training; redefine the institutional and financial relationship between the State and the private education sector.	Completed	Use of the study's recommendations for private operators in the sector. Signed decree relative to the status of private education vis a vis the State. Evaluation of the receiving capacity and analysis of the efficacy of State financing. Establishment of new laws redefining the institutional relationship between the State and the private sector. Improved use of the agreement. Use of the ongoing studies' recommendations.
1997	Improved Economic Model Study (CAPEC)	The study consisted of data gathering and model building for economic analysis of the internal efficiency of the education system as well as for budget projections over a ten year span, together with impact of cost reduction policy measures.	Completed	This study greatly contributed to the preparation of the PNDEF, in particular to the evaluation of actions to be financed by IDA. It allowed for: -better visibility of the financing policy of the education system (short-medium-, and long-term); -economic analysis of the Basic Education Project; -better internal efficacy with regard to projections; -analysis of the internal efficiency of the education system.
1996	Promotion of Higher Education Reform Study	Development and publication of a brochure on Higher Education Reform.	Completed	Information and awareness of the targeted public.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1996	Higher Education Software Study/Budget	Organize the start-up of budget management software use at the University of Cocody to develop a projection and planning model	Completed	-Verify the software with the specifications. -Begin software use -Use of the results in the development of contractual agreements between the State and the institutions.
1996	Material Inventory Study PAGRH Technology Inventory Study	Inventory the material in the PAGRH Inventory the material in the PAGRH	Completed	Evaluate recurrent costs with a view to integrating them in the budget of the beneficiary Ministries at the end of the Project.
1996	Evaluation of Technical Training Study	-Evaluation of the satisfaction of the users financed by the PAGRH. -Identify additional beneficiaries of technical training as well as technology companies.	Completed	-Better use of technical tools in the units; -Acquisition of work autonomy through the use of software; -Growth in the number of PC users -Satisfaction with the efficacy of users following training.
1996	Master plan for Higher Education	Development of a <i>Livre blanc</i> on Higher Education degrees..		Reform of the pedagogical structures and practices adopted. Follow-up on the planning process.
1996	Maintenance in Higher Education and Research Institutions	Improve maintenance in Higher Education and Research Institutions.	Completed	Distribution of the results to all decision makers and managers in the Ministry. Information and awareness of the heads of the Higher Education and Research Institutions.
1996	Evolution of partners' opinions on the University 1994 - 1996	Appreciation of the evolution of partners' opinions on the University 1994 - 1996	Completed	Use of the results in the Higher Education Reform.
1996	Girls' Education Determinants	Study on factors affecting girls' education.	Completed	-Establishment of a data bank on girls' education to be used by researchers -Awareness of the problems posed by girls' education in the northern region.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1996	Nutrition Action Plan	Support the National Nutritional Committee (Ministry of Agriculture) to develop a National Nutrition Action Plan.	Completed	The National Nutrition Action Plan developed thanks to PAGRH financing was presented as Côte d'Ivoire's contribution to the World Nutrition Summit in Rome in December 1996. At the national level, the action plan is being implemented.
1996	Development of a Communication System for the Education Sector..	Define a mode of means of communication and information to better integrate the education policies in Côte d'Ivoire.	Completed	Distribution to decision makers and managers in the education/training sector of useful and usable information.
1996	Study on Education Financing	1st phase: Inventory of existing data and studies, identification of missing or insufficient data, first definition of the chapter and methodology of a national education report. 2nd phase: Training of two resource-persons from the ministry, assistance with the definition and the realization of the necessary surveys, sectoral or regional data collection available following phase 1. 3rd phase: Refinement of the methodology and construction of a first national education report. Improve the understanding of the financing mechanisms and devaluate the impact of the different financiers in the education sector.	Completed	This study is the first step in the development of satellite reports on education: through implication of the ministries in the Project's objectives; this study allowed for an improvement in the statistics and planning directorate of the MENFB personnel capacity to finance the education sector. It also permitted: -obtaining data on private education; -training of two resource-persons in the ministry, one of whom was transferred to Tax Directorate. The difficulty is linked to obtaining regional data. The persons identified do not always have the data. A draft report was completed; the final report is not yet available.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1996	Study on Optimizing Higher Education Institution Facilities.	Establish a new inventory, determine actual usage and develop a planning basis for the future, in the framework of the master plan for higher education.	Completed	Optimisation of building use in university sites.
1996	Study on Internal Efficacy in Higher Education	The actions necessary to improve internal efficacy in Higher Education Institutions requires specific studies to better grasp the actual situation, in particular at the University level where weak internal efficacy has been noted.	Completed	Distribution of the results to decisionmakers and managers in the Higher Education System (results seminar held). Awareness of the directors of the university departments.
1996	Support to School Statistics Support to School Statistics (Phase II)	Continuation of Phase I.	Completed	This study permitted the production of information on the monitoring of school entry and more reliable school statistics. It is necessary to note the increased responsibility of the regional offices.
1996	Preliminary Study for the Investment Action Plan	In the scope of the implementation of the HRDP, the Government defined an objective of 90% enrollment rate by the year 2000. The first reviews of the plan resulted in delays in the study. This study was to propose an action plan to achieve this objective, with regard to construction of education facilities.	Completed	This study permitted the unblocking of a tranche of the HRDP. From this point of view, its impact was to contribute to the financing of the State budget.
1996	Study on School Cooperatives	Identify the school cooperatives which perform well, the conditions leading to their success and analyze their means of operation and management, in light of other schools.	Completed	Findings integrated in the preparation of the Basic Education Project.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1996	Support to School Statistics (Phase I)	Development of a National Education Statistical Information System.	Completed	Thanks to support from the HRDMP, this study helped to centralize and standardize the information at the Ministry.
1994	Support the School Mapping	Improved tools at the disposal of the local and regional offices, the awareness and training seminars.	Completed	First improvement in the mastering of the school map.
1995	Study on internal efficacy of school system	Collect statistics on the new entrants, repeaters, and drop outs, and the exclusions by sector and year in each institution; calculate the average promotion, repeater and drop out rates during the past five years; calculate the loss, average study duration, etc. rates; establish fluctuation diagrams, define the projections for the student population for the next five years.	Completed	Begin improvement of data analysis of the education system.
1995	Study of additional resources for more efficient usage of the <i>Lycée Scientifique</i> at Yamoussoukro	Analyze and propose uses for the <i>Lycée</i> infrastructure which will ensure financing, maintenance, and quality of education at the Institution.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.
1995	Socioeconomic study of social security beneficiaries	Grasp the attitude and behavior of the population with regard to paying for health care insurance.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.

Table 6: Studies Included in Project (cont'd)

Year	Study	Purpose as defined at appraisal/redefined	Status	Impact of Study
1995	Study of the cost of health benefits and the beneficiary's ability to pay	Evaluate the types of medical benefits provided in the hospitals and medical centers; evaluate the average unit cost of medical benefits; determine the cost rate, and the means for taxation and payment.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.
1995	Study of the information system and the management of the new subsector	Identify the insured populations; determine the financial equilibrium and the risk; control the demand and offer of care; ensure flexibility in management.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.
1995	Study of project planning	Determine the conditions for the progressive implementation of the system.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.
1994	Socioeconomic study on Social Security in Côte d'Ivoire	Identify resources necessary; evaluate the human, material, and financial resources in order to develop a realistic and efficient action plan; determine eventual strengths and weaknesses in order to foresee necessary adjustments to ensure its sustainability.	Canceled	Not relevant for Government policy.

Table 7A: Project Costs

Item	Appraisal estimate (US\$M)			Actual/latest estimate (US\$M)		
	Local	Foreign	Total	Local	Foreign	Total
1. Consultant Services			3.3			3.63
2. Equipment, Computers			0.3			0.82
3. Operating Costs			0.1			0.62
4. Pre-Investment Studies			1.5			1.36
5. Refund P770/0-1-IVC			1.0			0.06
6. Unallocated			0.5			0.00
SA-A CAA A/C No. 467 037						0.03
SA-P Trans. from P770-0-IVC						0.03
TOTAL			6.7			6.55

Table 7B: Project Financing

Source	Appraisal estimate (US\$M)			Actual/latest estimate (US\$M)		
	Local	Foreign	Total	Local	Foreign	Total
IDA	1.8	4.9	6.7			6.6
Government	1.2		1.2			1.2
Total	3.0	4.9	7.9			7.8

Table 8: Status of Legal Covenants

SELECTION NO. OF CREDIT/LOAN AGREEMENT	COVENANT	STATUS C = In Comp. CD = Compliance after Delay CP = Comp. with Partially NC = Not in Compliance. NYD = Not yet due	COMMENTS
4.01 (a)	The Borrower shall maintain or cause to be maintained records and accounts adequate to reflect in accordance with sound accounting practices the operations, resources, and expenditures in respect of the Project of the departments or agencies of the Borrower responsible for carrying out the Project or any part thereof.	C	None
4.01 (b)	The Borrower shall: (i) have the records and accounts referred to in para. (a) of this Section including those for the Specila Account and the Project Account for each fiscal year audited, in accordance with appropriate auditing principles consistently applied by independent auditors acceptable to the Association.	C	None
4.01 (b)	(ii) furnish to the Association, as soon as available, but in any case not later than six months after the end of each such year, a certified copy of the report of such audit by said auditors, of such scope and in such detail as the Association shall have reasonably requested; and	C	None
4.01 (b)	(iii) furnish to the Association such other information concerning said records, accounts and the audit thereof as the Association shall from time to time reasonably request.	C	None
4.01 (c)	For all expenditures with respect to which withdrawals from the Credit Account were made on the basis of statements of expenditure, the Borrower shall:	C	None
4.01 (c)	(i) maintain, or cause to be maintained, in accordance with para. (a) of this Section records and accounts reflecting such expenditures;	C	None
4.01 (c)	(ii) retain, until at least one year after the Association has received the audit report for the fiscal year in whcih the last withdrawal from the Credit Account was made, all records (contracts, orders invoices, bills, receipts and other documents) evidencing such expenditures;	C	None
4.01 (c)	(iii) enable the Association's representatives to examine such records; and	C	None
4.01 (c)	(iv) ensure that such records and accounts are included in the annual audit referred to in para. (b) of this Section and that the report of such audit contains a separate opinion by said auditors as to whether the statements of expenditure submitted during such fiscal year, together with the procedures and internal controls involved in their preparation can be relied upon.	C	None

Table 9: Bank Resources: Staff Inputs

Stage of Project Cycle	Planned		Actual	
	Staff Weeks	US\$ ('000)	Staff Weeks	US\$ ('000)
Preparation to appraisal	N/A	N/A	14.6	37.7
Appraisal	N/A	N/A	5.7	15.2
Negotiation through Board approval	N/A	N/A	17.1	45.6
Supervision*	40.1	67.3	73.0	120.0
Completion*	17.0	23.2	16.3	26.2
TOTAL	57.1	90.5	127.4	244.7

Table 10: Bank Resources: Missions

Stage of project cycle	Month/year	Number of persons	Days in Field	Specialized staff skills represented	Performance Rating		Types of problems
					Implemen. Status	Develop. objectives	
Through appraisal	3/92	5	14				
Appraisal through Board	6/92	3	13	PE, OA, ES			
Board through effectiveness	7/93	2	11	PE, OO	1	1	
	11/93	2	2	PE, OO	1	1	
Supervision	5/94	2	6	PE/OS, MS	S	S	A number of cumbersome systems which confront project management on the Borrower's side. Readjustments in terms of nature, duration, and location of Technical Assistance.
	10/94	3	6	PE/OPS, MS	S	S	
Mid-Term Review	4/95	4	30	MS, FM, PE/OS, SOO			Although the delays experienced earlier are being overcome, all activities will not be completed by Dec. 1996. Disbursement problem likely if counterpart funds are not available before June 30.
	6/95	5	30	S, E, PA, FM, E	S	S	
	3/96	2	5	E, OS	S	S	
	7/96	2		E, OS			
	4/97	4	5	PS, 2-E, DA			
Completion	12/97	2	2	E, PE			
	2/98	3	5	E, PE, PA			

DA=Disbursement Assistant
 E=Economist
 ES=Educational Specialist
 FM=Financial Management Specialist
 MS=Management Specialist
 OA=Operations Analyst
 OO=Operations Officer

OS=Operations Specialist
 PA=Programs Assistant
 PE=Principal Economist
 PS=Procurement Specialist
 S=Sociologist
 SOO=Senior Operations Officer

PROJET D'APPUI A LA GESTION DES RESSOURCES HUMAINES
MISSION DE CLOTURE
DECEMBRE 1997

1. Une mission de clôture du projet d'appui à la gestion des ressources humaines (PAGRH, crédit 2505-IVC) s'est déroulée en Côte d'Ivoire du 4 au 5 décembre 1997. La mission était conduite par Catherine Laurent, économiste, chargée du projet, et Rachidi Radji, économiste principal. La mission avait pour objet de participer à l'atelier de clôture du projet organisé par la Côte d'Ivoire.

I. ATELIER DE CLOTURE DU PROJET

2. Un atelier de restitution des résultats du projet, par les quatre administrations bénéficiaires (ministères de la santé publique, de l'éducation et la formation de base, l'enseignement supérieur et de l'enseignement technique et de la formation professionnelle) et l'administration chef de file (ministère de l'économie et des finances) a été organisé les 4 et 5 décembre 1997 en Abidjan, par le secrétariat permanent du comité des opérations du programme d'ajustement sectoriel de valorisation des ressources humaines (COPVRH). Les participants étaient l'équipe qui sera chargée de rédiger la contribution ivoirienne au rapport de fin d'exécution du projet.

3. Les principales conclusions des présentations et discussions seront reflétées avec plus de détail dans le rapport d'achèvement, à la fois dans la partie rédigée par l'IDA et dans celle rédigée par la Côte d'Ivoire. Quelques aspects méritent cependant d'être d'ores et déjà relevés, qui ont affecté soit positivement soit négativement le déroulement du projet, et pourront servir de leçons pour de futurs projets. Les participants ont notamment souligné:

- **L'orientation du PAGRH.** Initialement conçu comme une assistance technique à la mise en oeuvre du PVRH (prêt 3428 et crédits 2323-0, 2323-1 et 2323-2-IVC), le PAGRH a finalement été taillé sur mesure pour compléter le projet d'appui à la gestion de l'économie (PAGE) dans les ministères sociaux. Cela a abouti à centrer ses activités sur le renforcement institutionnel des administrations responsables de la gestion des secteurs sociaux, ainsi que de l'administration responsable du suivi de leurs budgets.

- La lenteur de mise en oeuvre de la composante 4, **sous-composante Etudes de pré-investissement**, débloquée par la revue à mi-parcours effectuée en juin 1995, mais aussi son utilité une fois opérationnalisée, notamment pour la réalisation de l'étude sur l'évolution du niveau de vie des ménages, et d'autres études importantes dans le cadre de la préparation du projet de développement des services de santé intégrés (Cr. 2893-IVC), de la réforme de l'enseignement supérieur et d'un projet d'appui à l'éducation de base évalué en décembre 1997.

- Les résultats positifs enregistrés dans le **renforcement des capacités** de gestion, au centre, des directions responsables du personnel, de la planification et des affaires financières pour les secteurs santé et éducation, ainsi que dans les unités déconcentrées pour l'éducation de base, même si ce constat doit être nuancé, compte tenu notamment des faiblesses persistantes. En effet, l'ensemble des besoins n'a pas pu être couvert et l'intérêt des responsables concernés n'a pas toujours été à la hauteur des investissements réalisés par (et au niveau) de leurs collaborateurs.

- Les résultats positifs enregistrés dans la catégorie 3, **Ecoles témoins**, réseau d'écoles primaires disséminées dans tout le pays, dans l'expérimentation d'approches innovatrices visant à améliorer la qualité de l'enseignement dans les établissements concernés (taux de promotion porté de 30 à 38%).

- L'assistance technique financée sur le projet (71% du crédit) a été majoritairement une assistance locale (62% des montants). Elle a aussi été, volontairement, conçue comme un appui temporaire et discontinu, afin de bien assurer le transfert des compétences aux unités appuyées.

- Le crédit, prévu initialement pour trois ans, a en réalité, si l'on inclut l'avance de préparation du projet, duré cinq années, compte tenu de la prolongation en juillet 1996 jusqu'au 31 décembre 1997. Il a fait l'objet de deux réallocations des fonds entre catégories. Il a souffert de ce que la budgétisation des **fonds de contrepartie** n'a pas été revue en conséquence, et leur versement a toujours été retardé, parfois de six mois.

- L'importance critique de la permanence de l'équipe chargée de gérer le projet au sein du ministère de l'économie et des finances, du début à la fin du crédit, notamment pour la synergie avec le cadrage macro-économique (DCPE, PIP, HIPC, revue des dépenses publiques).

- La nécessité pour la Côte d'Ivoire de **prendre en compte dans son budget de fonctionnement la relève de certaines activités** prises en charge par le projet initialement, notamment la poursuite des Ecoles témoins et le renforcement des directions centrales et régionales des deux ministères de l'éducation (MENFB et METFP) et des universités et EPN relevant du MESRIT.

II. ELABORATION DU RAPPORT DE FIN D'EXECUTION DU CREDIT

4. Une lettre en date du 5 novembre 1997 a été adressée par l'IDA au ministre de l'économie et des finances, expliquant le processus et les responsabilités respectives de l'IDA et de l'emprunteur pour le rapport de fin d'exécution. L'atelier de décembre a été organisé de façon à préparer la contribution de l'emprunteur.

5. Un calendrier a été arrêté: la contribution de l'IDA pour le rapport de fin d'exécution devrait être disponible à la mi-janvier pour l'emprunteur, tandis que la participation de celui-ci devrait également être communiquée dans ces délais à l'IDA. Les comptes du projet devant être clos fin décembre, une mission devrait être effectuée par l'IDA vers la mi-février 1998 pour permettre d'achever l'élaboration de ce rapport, qui devrait être présenté au conseil d'administration de l'IDA avant la fin juin 1998.

Fait à Washington, le 12 janvier 1998

Catherine Laurent

Groupe Population et ressources humaines 3, AFTH3

Région Afrique

PROJET D'APPUI A LA GESTION DES RESSOURCES HUMAINES

(CREDIT N° 2505-IVC)

MISSION DE RAPPORT DE FIN D'EXECUTION (FEVRIER 1998)

1. Conformément aux dispositions rappelées dans l'aide-mémoire de la précédente mission de clôture du projet d'appui à la gestion des ressources humaines, P.A.G.R.H., crédit n° 2505-IVC, en décembre 1997, une mission s'est déroulée en Abidjan du 22 au 27 février 1998, afin de préparer le rapport de fin d'exécution du projet. Elle comprenait Catherine Laurent, chargée du projet, et Ross Pfile, assistant de programmes.
2. Les parties I et II du rapport, représentant la contribution de la Banque, ont été élaborées en collaboration avec l'emprunteur. Elles sont annexées au présent aide-mémoire. L'emprunteur aura donc à nous faire part de ses commentaires éventuels et à nous fournir des compléments d'information pour la liste des études, et nous communiquer sa propre contribution d'ici au 15 avril.
3. La mission remercie l'ensemble des personnes rencontrées et du temps qu'elles ont pu lui consacrer.

Fait en Abidjan, le 27 février 1998.

Catherine Laurent, chargée du projet

Human Resources Development Management Support Project Summary of the Government's Report

The Human Resources Development Management Project (HRDMP) was conceived (a) to continue World Bank support to the horizontal ministries; and (b) to assist, in a specific manner, the administrations involved in realizing the ambitious reforms undertaken in the HRMD. The HRDMP supported the implementation of essential components of the HRMD, and attempted to correct certain structural weaknesses discovered in the HRMD.

Government was closely associated with project preparation, and it (a) identified the needs, (b) defined the terms of reference, and (c) defined the work programs for technical assistance. It should be noted that, at project conception, beneficiary services were few; their number increased during project implementation.

The HRDMP permitted the creation of favorable conditions to improve management in the beneficiary ministries through: (a) establishing or re-establishing the coordination and impetus for internal reforms in the ministries responsible for human resources; (b) making reliable data available, and ensuring their continued, regular production; (c) making available rational and pertinent support for primary and secondary school teachers; (d) instituting monitoring and execution of budgets by level and type of expenditure; and (e) implementing in all EPN of the MESRIT budgetary management tools.

Borrower and Bank actions which delayed project execution include: (a) delays in receiving non-objections from the Bank notably for computer equipment; (b) institutional instability; (c) communication between the different partners in the ministries; and (d) availability of counterpart funds.

During the in-country workshop in December 1997, the following recommendations to reduce delays were made:

- With regard to communication difficulties, establishing electronic mail for internal and external communication
- With regard to budget, (a) planning activities taking into account the budget; (b) establishing conditions for priority activities; and (c) pre-investment studies for the execution of the action plan
- With regard to project sustainability, (a) greater stability of those responsible for the project; (b) development of project procedure manuals to preserve project memory; and (c) distribution of project reports.

Lessons for future projects in Côte d'Ivoire include:

- (a) complete understanding of project objectives by the ministry directors' teams;
- (b) the coordination and management team should have the means to keep new arrival informed, and motivate the partners in the other ministries; and
- (c) national and international expertise is possible only if the expectations and penalties are clearly defined.

REPUBLIQUE DE COTE D'IVOIRE

Union – Discipline – Travail

MINISTERE DE L'ECONOMIE ET DES FINANCES

COMITE DES OPERATIONS DU PROGRAMME DE
VALORISATION DES RESSOURCES HUMAINES

**RAPPORT D'ACHEVEMENT DU PROJET D'APPUI
A LA GESTION DES RESSOURCES HUMAINES : 1994 – 1997
Cr 2505 IVC, approuvé par le CA de l'IDA en Juin 1993**

SECRETARIAT PERMANENT DU COMITE DES OPERATIONS DU PVRH

Mai 1998

PREFACE : Identification du projet

La genèse du Projet d'Appui à la Gestion des Ressources Humaines (PAGRHR) fait appel à deux éléments historiques complémentaires : (a) d'une part, la nécessité de prolonger l'appui de la Banque Mondiale aux ministères horizontaux (Finances, Fonction Publique, Justice) à travers le Projet d'Appui à la Gestion Economique (PAGE) dans les ministères sectoriels dont l'importance des parts dans le budget de l'Etat exige qu'ils contribuent de manière significative à la mise en œuvre des réformes entreprises sur la période de 1990-94 ; (b) d'autre part, aider de façon spécifique les administrations impliquées dans la réalisation des réformes ambitieuses entreprises dans le cadre du Programme de valorisation des ressources humaines (PVRH).

Concernant l'aspect lié au PVRH, il convient de rappeler que le PVRH était un ensemble de réformes ambitieuses et complexes dont la mise en œuvre de certaines mesures exigeait soit un appui institutionnel d'accompagnement, soit des ressources additionnelles qui n'étaient pas prévues dans le budget de l'Etat. Ces réformes visaient les domaines et fonctions suivantes :

- a) Contrôle de l'évolution des dépenses (fonctionnement et investissement) du secteur des Ressources Humaines.
- b) Adoption de Politiques Gouvernementales permettant de mieux répondre aux besoins des populations dans le secteur des Ressources Humaines.
- c) Maîtrise des dépenses (faible croissance de la masse salariale, maîtrise des dépenses de transferts sociaux, réduction des coûts unitaires...).
- d) Amélioration de la gestion du personnel.

Au regard de la complexité du PVRH et à l'état des institutions chargées de le mettre en œuvre, force est de constater que certains engagements de ce programme avaient été pris en surestimant la capacité des administrations chargées de la mise en œuvre des mesures avec satisfaction (stabilisation du nombre d'étudiants à 15 000, scolarisation universelle projetée à 90% à l'horizon 2000, redéploiement du personnel enseignant, médical et para-médical, etc.).

Ainsi, à la mise en vigueur du prêt BIRD et du crédit IDA associés au PVRH, le 8 Janvier 1992, l'on s'est rendu compte que le déroulement satisfaisant de ce programme pourrait être compromis si des appuis aux fonctions essentielles liées au processus de gestion n'étaient pas identifiés et les ressources afférentes mobilisées.

A partir de ce constat, le Gouvernement a engagé des discussions avec la Banque Mondiale, qui ont abouti, lors de la supervision du PVRH en Mars 1992, à l'identification d'un projet d'appui dont les caractéristiques sont présentées ci-après :

Le présent rapport, qui fait partie intégrante du "Rapport d'achèvement du projet", s'articule autour des points suivants :

- a) description du projet.
- b) conception, exécution, réalisation et impact du projet.
- c) analyse critique de l'action de la Banque, du Gouvernement et de l'assistance technique.

- d) évaluation économique et financière.
- e) résumé des principales conclusions.

I. DESCRIPTION ET DEMARRAGE DU PROJET

I. 1 Historique :

I.1.1. Contexte politique

Outre les conditions générales, les actions réalisées pour l'entrée en vigueur du crédit étaient les suivantes :

- sélection sur une base compétitive des consultants pour les composantes 1 et 2
- sélection du Conseiller technique de la composante 3
- nomination du Coordonnateur National
- sélection d'un conseiller technique auprès du Comité des Opérations du programme de valorisation des Ressources Humaines (COPVRH) pour le transfert de technologie
- dépôt d'un montant de 75 millions de FCFA sur le compte du projet ouvert dans une banque commerciale acceptable par l'IDA.

Une réallocation des fonds entre les catégories du projet a eu lieu en Janvier 1996 puis en Septembre 1997. Une augmentation du montant initial du compte spécial a été réalisée en Décembre 1995.

I.1.2 Situation économique et sociale

Le PVRH a été approuvé en 1991, mais la dévaluation du FCFA a conduit à une restructuration des prêts initialement consentis. L'objectif principal du PVRH était de corriger des tendances défavorables révélées par les indicateurs sociaux de base, notamment l'espérance de vie, la mortalité infantile et le taux de scolarisation primaire, dont la faiblesse mettait en péril les efforts de développement du pays. Pour cela, la qualité de l'offre des services publics de santé et d'éducation devait être améliorée, tout comme la couverture de la population pour les niveaux primaires. Le PVRH a apporté un appui budgétaire soumis à des progrès dans les domaines suivants:

- a) suivi de l'exécution des budgets et de l'efficacité des programmes dans les secteurs des ressources humaines ;
- b) adoption officielle d'une déclaration de politique de développement des ressources humaines ;
- c) amélioration de la pérennité financière en introduisant un recouvrement des coûts dans les établissements de santé et de formation avec un contrôle des transferts sociaux en faveur des étudiants du secondaire et du supérieur; et
- d) amélioration de la capacité de mise en œuvre par de meilleurs outils de gestion et de suivi.

1.1.3. Cadre institutionnel

Le PAGRH soutenait l'exécution des composantes essentielles du PVRH du Gouvernement pour lequel un prêt de la Banque mondiale et un crédit de l'IDA ont été approuvés le 20 Décembre 1991. Le Gouvernement avait rempli toutes les conditions de mise en vigueur du programme au 8 Janvier 1992. L'expérience du PVRH a mis en évidence certaines faiblesses structurelles que le PAGRH a tenté de corriger.

La responsabilité de l'exécution du PAGRH incombait aux sous comités du programme, qui existaient dans chacun des Ministères techniques s'occupant des Ressources Humaines. La coordination et la supervision interministérielles du programme incombait au COPVRH. Il se réunissait chaque semaine pour informer le Premier Ministre et le Ministre de l'Economie et des Finances de l'état d'avancement de l'exécution du programme et pour décider des mesures corrective éventuellement nécessaires. Le COPVRH était chargé aussi de la coordination avec les donateurs et les bailleurs de fonds et veillait à la compatibilité du programme avec la situation macro-économique. Le Secrétariat Permanent du COPVRH, organe d'exécution, a joué pendant cette période le rôle d'agence d'exécution pour l'ensemble des activités du projet.

1.2 Objectifs du projet

A long terme, le projet visait les objectifs suivants :

- renforcer les procédures de budgétisation, programmation et planification fonctionnelle au niveau des ministères techniques ;
- suivre et évaluer l'impact des services éducatifs et sanitaires auprès des bénéficiaires
- améliorer la qualité de la prestation des services éducatifs et médicaux.

A court terme, il s'agissait d'aider les ministères bénéficiaires dans la mise en œuvre du PVRH.

1.3 Composantes du projet

Le projet avait quatre composantes :

- Composante 1: Planification, programmation et budgétisation.
- Composante 2: Suivi et évaluation par les bénéficiaires.
- Composante 3: Initiative portant sur la qualité des Ecoles.
- Composante 4: Appui à la gestion et études de préinvestissement.

Composante 1 : Renforcement des capacités de planification, de programmation et de budgétisation des ministères techniques.

A travers cette composante, le PAGRH devait (a) renforcer les capacités des ministères techniques, (b) apporter une assistance technique et former le personnel des ministères bénéficiaires.

Concernant le renforcement des capacités des ministères techniques, il s'agissait: (i) d'analyser la structure des dépenses (fonctionnement et investissement) en vue d'identifier des gains d'efficience; (ii) préparer des budgets de fonctionnement et d'investissement sur la base de priorités de dépenses claires et cohérentes et des normes standards; et (iii) participer de manière efficace à la préparation du budget et au processus

d'arbitrage, grâce à la mise au point de modèle de programmation budgétaire et de normes d'exploitation.

Quant à l'assistance technique et la formation du personnel des ministères bénéficiaires les actions, elles devaient contribuer à : (i) l'élaboration et l'utilisation de modèles de programmation budgétaire; (ii) l'établissement de procédures d'exploitation normalisées et de procédures interdépartementales et interministérielles de flux des informations; et (iii) l'amélioration des méthodes de travail.

Composante 2 : Renforcement des capacités de suivi et d'évaluation des ministères techniques.

L'objectif de cette composante était de : (a) renforcer le suivi et l'évaluation du processus budgétaire grâce à la création de procédures officielles régissant les flux d'informations à l'intérieur des administrations, y compris la préparation de rapports trimestriels sur l'exécution des budgets ; et (b) renforcer le suivi et l'évaluation de la performance des prestations de service par les ministères.

Composante 3 : Initiative portant sur la qualité des écoles

Par cette composante, le projet devait apporter une assistance au ministère de l'éducation nationale en vue de renforcer sa capacité à promouvoir la qualité et l'efficacité dans les écoles primaires grâce à un programme de réseaux d'écoles témoins.

Composante 4 : Appui à la gestion et études de préinvestissement

Par cette composante, le projet devait appuyer le COPVRH pour ce qui est de la gestion du projet et de la supervision du PVRH, et (b) déterminer des études de préinvestissement au cours de l'exécution de projet.

II- CONCEPTION, EXECUTION, REALISATION ET IMPACT DU PROJET

II.1 Evaluation de la conception du projet

Le Gouvernement ivoirien a été étroitement associé à la conception du projet. Sa participation s'est traduite par l'identification des besoins, la définition des termes de référence et des programmes de travail pour l'appui technique.

Il faut cependant noter que lors de la conception, les services bénéficiaires identifiés étaient peu nombreux. Leur nombre s'est accru au cours de l'exécution du projet par suite des réorganisations et restructurations intervenues dans l'administration ivoirienne.

II.2 Principaux résultats obtenus dans chacune des composantes du projet

II.2.1 Composante 1: Renforcement des capacités de Planification, de Programmation et de Budgétisation des Ministères Techniques.

• Ministère de l'Education Nationale et de la Formation de Base (MENFB)

- * optimisation du système d'information statistique grâce à une assistance technique ;
- * amélioration dans la maîtrise de la carte scolaire ;
- * meilleure rationalisation de la gestion des ressources humaines du MENFB ;

- * mise en place d'une procédure de recensement des personnels du MENFB ;
- * amélioration des capacités de gestion budgétaire au niveau central et au niveau déconcentré par: a) le recrutement d'assistants administratifs et comptables pour les directions régionales de l'éducation nationale (DREN); b) la mise en place de conférences budgétaires régionales et nationales; c) élaboration de normes et de nomenclatures des dépenses; d) élaboration de plans de charge de la gestion des bourses scolaires ;
- * acquisition de micro-ordinateurs et formation à l'utilisation de ces matériels.

- **Ministère de l'Enseignement Technique et de la Formation Professionnelle (METFP)**

- * transfert des acquis du PAGRH au METFP qui a été créé pendant l'exécution du projet ;
- * formation des responsables d'établissements à la méthode d'élaboration des projets ;
- * information et sensibilisation des responsables d'établissements sur: a) les nouvelles orientations du ministère; b) les nouveaux projets et leur gestion; c) la dimension entrepreneuriale; d) la maintenance.

Le projet a permis d'équiper le Cabinet, la Cellule d'appui technique, la Direction de la Planification et la DAF (matériels informatiques et fournitures techniques).

- **Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieur de la Recherche et de l'Innovation Technologique (MESRIT)**

- * appui au processus de budgétisation (DAAF) pour la conception d'un outil de gestion budgétaire et l'implantation à titre expérimental d'un progiciel à l'Université de Cocody ;
- * mise en place d'un dispositif de gestion technico-pédagogique ;
- * conception du système d'information pour l'enseignement supérieur (SIVES) ;
- * mise en place de base de données sur les scolarités ;
- * assistance à la gestion des ressources humaines ;
- * informatisation des scolarités des Universités.

- **Ministère de la Santé (MSP)**

- * suivi comptable et budgétaire du recouvrement des coûts dans les formations sanitaires publiques (hôpitaux généraux, CHR) ;
- * suivi en temps réel du budget par la mise en place d'un système informatique central (BGF) ;
- * décentralisation de la confection du budget ;
- * acquisition de micro-ordinateurs et formation à l'utilisation de ces matériels pour des personnels de la DAF et de la DRH ;
- * mise en place d'une procédure de recensement du personnel de la Santé ;
- * transfert de compétence de l'assistance technique à la DAF ;
- * formation à l'utilisation de l'ensemble des outils de gestion du ministère de la santé (recouvrement des coûts, élaboration et exécution du budget).

II.2.2 Composante 2: Renforcement des capacités de suivi et d'évaluation des ministères techniques.

- **MENFB**

- * trois (3) enquêtes ont été réalisées: a) enquête de suivi de cohorte d'élèves (CM2, 3^{ème}, 2^{nde} et terminale); b) enquête sur les bibliothèques scolaires et sur les coûts des manuels scolaires; c) enquête sur le rendement des élèves de CE2 et 3^{ème}. Toutes ces enquêtes ont fait l'objet de publications actuellement disponibles à la DPES ;
- * mise en place de l'observatoire du CP1.

- **MESRIT**

- * plusieurs sondages d'opinion ont été réalisés sur la réforme de l'Enseignement Supérieur et la politique des Bourses (1994, 1995, 1996, 1997) ;
- * une étude d'opinion des chefs d'entreprises et des Cadres a été réalisée sur les besoins en formation ;

II.2.3 Composante 3 : Initiative portant sur la qualité des écoles

Au niveau de la recherche de la qualité, le PAGRH a axé ses efforts sur les écoles primaires. Ce qui a donné lieu à la mise en place du projet Ecoles-Témoins avec l'atteinte des résultats suivants :

- * mise en place d'équipes nationales formées à l'élaboration, au suivi et l'évaluation de plans d'actions ;
- * accroissement de la participation des parents à la gestion des Ecoles témoins ;
- * amélioration sensible des résultats scolaires dans les Ecoles témoins ;
- * une relative dynamisation des équipes Ecoles témoins et de leur encadrement ;
- * maîtrise des outils bureautiques par l'équipe nationale des Ecoles témoins ;
- * mise à la disposition de la coordination nationale des animateurs et des Ecoles témoins de moyens logistiques ;
- * réalisation de 4 études confiées à des experts nationaux ;
- * mise en place des observatoires régionaux des Ecoles témoins ;
- * production de synthèses thématiques conçues comme outil méthodologique à l'implantation des innovations pédagogiques ;
- * transfert de compétences de l'assistance technique à la coordination des Ecoles-Témoins.

II.2.4 Composante 4: Appui à la Gestion et Etudes de Préinvestissement.

- **MENFB**

- * une étude sur la déconcentration du MENFB.
- * 4 études sur l'efficacité interne du système: a) étude sur le financement de l'éducation confiée à l'IREDU de Dijon; b) études sur les déterminants de la scolarisation confiée au ROCARE; c) étude sur la communication interne et externe du MENFB; d) Etude sur l'enseignement primaire et secondaire privé ;
- * une étude sur le ciblage des zones sous scolarisées en vue d'interventions prioritaires.

- **METFP**

- * trois (3) études étaient prévues: (a) une étude sur l'état des lieux; (b) une étude sur la communication; et (c) une étude sur les filières porteuses d'emploi.
- * sur ces 3 études prévues, seule l'étude sur le système de la communication a été réalisée.

- **MESRIT**

- * des Audits budgétaires et opérationnels ont été réalisés sur les Universités, le CNOU et les Grandes Ecoles ;
- * des études sur le schéma directeur de l'Enseignement Supérieur :
- * la réalisation d'un livre blanc sur l'enseignement supérieur
- * la définition de l'architecture des formations universitaires
- * mise en place d'un logiciel capable de définir une programmation des moyens
- * implantation en cours d'un outil de programmation au sein des Vices Présidences à la planification et à la programmation des Universités ;
- * diagnostic des problèmes de maintenance dans toutes les structures du MESRIT ;
- * des études d'implantation, définition des caractéristiques pédagogiques et le mode d'organisation des structures dans le cadre de la mise en œuvre de l'enseignement à distance ;
- * une étude sur le rendement interne de l'enseignement supérieur ;
- * une étude sur les filières porteuses ;
- * une étude sur l'optimisation des locaux .

Concernant la formation en informatique , il convient d'indiquer qu'environ 84 cadres et personnel d'appui du Ministère ont bénéficié d'une formation en informatique, pour l'utilisation de logiciels de base (traitement de textes et tableur) et une douzaine de cadres statisticiens, informaticiens ont bénéficié d'une formation aux logiciels de base de données et de traitement statistique (FOX-PRO, ARIEL, SPSS-PC). Ces formations ont permis d'améliorer sensiblement la capacité de gestion des services bénéficiaires.

Quant à l'appui logistique, il faut souligner que les services qui ont bénéficié des équipements informatiques sont la DESUP, la DAAF, les services administratifs des établissements de l'enseignement supérieur. L'appui logistique a par ailleurs touché l'organisation de séminaires, de missions, de fournitures techniques, de production et de diffusion des documents.

II. 3 Coordination et gestion du projet

Responsabilités du coordonnateur . Le Coordonnateur informait le Ministre et le Cabinet sur l'état d'exécution du projet, il assurait la liaison entre le projet et le cabinet du ministère.

Relations entre le coordonnateur du projet et les directeurs techniques. Pour certains projets, l'information n'a pas toujours circulé au sein des Ministères, ce qui a entraîné des incompréhensions et des frustrations.

Leçons à tirer pour les projets à venir:

- * tenir des rapports périodiques pour mieux partager l'information,
- * disposer de cahiers de charge des projets ou des missions,
- * rapports suivis entre le coordonnateur et l'Administrateur du projet,
- * appropriation du projet par les Directions techniques,
- * assurer une plus grande stabilité des responsables de projet,
- * élaborer un manuel de procédure pour préserver la mémoire de projet,
- * diffuser des rapports relatifs aux projets.

II. 4 Impact du projet dans la mise en œuvre de la politique nationale de développement des ressources humaines.

Etant donné que le PAGRH a contribué à la mise en œuvre du PVRH, il aura permis au Gouvernement de considérer les secteurs des ressources humaines comme prioritaires pour l'allocation des ressources budgétaires et la définition de politiques sociales. Il a été d'un apport appréciable dans l'amélioration de la capacité de mise en œuvre de la Politique nationale de développement des Ressources Humaines notamment dans la déconcentration de la Gestion budgétaire, Initiation et par perfectionnement dans l'utilisation de l'outil informatique, dans l'acquisition d'équipement de gestion. Il a permis de créer les conditions favorables à l'amélioration à la gestion des Ministères bénéficiaires, par la :

- * prise (ou reprise) en main par les Cabinets Ministériels chargés des RH, du rôle de coordination et d'impulsion des réformes internes ;
- * disponibilité d'informations fiables sur les secteurs, avec la garantie de leur production régulière :
- * statistiques de l'enseignement supérieur ;
- * statistiques de l'enseignement primaire/secondaire ;
- * carte sanitaire en cours de finalisation ;
- * carte scolaire impulsée dans le primaire ;
- * disponibilité de supports rationnels et pertinents de gestion des effectifs enseignants du primaire et du secondaire, permettant un redéploiement et des affectations à dates fixes ;
- * instauration de réflexe de suivi de l'exécution des budgets par niveau et par type de dépense, avec une préoccupation établie, d'améliorer le taux d'exécution des dépenses prioritaires ;
- * mise en place dans l'ensemble des EPN du MESRIT d'outils de gestion budgétaire.

III ANALYSE CRITIQUE DE L'ACTION DE LA BANQUE, DU GOUVERNEMENT ET DE L'ASSISTANCE TECHNIQUE

Lors de l'atelier de présentation des résultats du PAGRH, organisé en Décembre 1997, les représentants des services bénéficiaires ont donné leur sentiment sur le rôle des partenaires pendant le déroulement du projet. De l'analyse de leur déclaration, il ressort les points suivants:

III.1 Les rôles respectifs du Gouvernement et de la Banque Mondiale dans l'identification et la conception du PAGRH.

Le PAGRH est un projet d'assistance technique dont la mise en place a été intimement liée aux insuffisances révélées dans le cadre de la mise en œuvre du Programme de Valorisation des Ressources Humaines. Ces insuffisances se rapportaient à l'inexistence au niveau de l'administration de capacités réelles de conception, de planification, de programmation de gestion budgétaire et de suivi.

L'idée du projet PAGRH a donc été soumise par la Banque Mondiale à la Côte d'Ivoire qui l'a acceptée. La préparation et la rédaction des termes de références ont été confiées au Secrétariat Permanent du PVRH.

Certaines administrations étaient mieux préparées pour profiter des opportunités offertes par le PAGRH. Ainsi, dans le cadre du PVRH le Ministère de l'Enseignement Supérieure avait déjà fait un diagnostic par rapport aux établissements d'enseignement supérieur. Par ailleurs, dans le déroulement du projet, des modifications de profils des consultants ont été effectuées en fonction des revues périodiques et ont permis d'ajuster les objectifs du PVRH.

III.2. Les rôles respectifs du Gouvernement et de la Banque Mondiale dans le suivi du projet (suivi quotidien, missions de supervision de l'IDA).

La première période du PAGRH a vu le projet piloté par des comités ministériels compétents pour l'ensemble des projets dans chaque Ministère. Il en est résulté que nombreux sont les responsables au niveau des différents ministères qui ignoraient l'existence du PAGRH.

Par conséquent, lors de la revue à mi-parcours, un coordinateur du PAGRH par ministère a été mis en place.

La Banque Mondiale a effectué, en quatre (4) ans, huit (8) missions dont une n'a pas fait l'objet d'aide mémoire. Les délais de traitement de certains dossiers était très longs. Mais, suite à la responsabilisation des représentants locaux de la Banque Mondiale a permis de réduire substantiellement ces délais.

III.3. Identification des principales décisions de ces deux partenaires, ayant pu favoriser ou freiner l'exécution du PAGRH (procédures, réglementation, trésorerie, etc.)

Les actions qui ont pu perturber l'exécution du PAGRH peuvent être ainsi résumées :

- * les délais importants au niveau de l'avis de non objection de la Banque et de l'appel d'offre pour l'acquisition de matériel informatique ;
- * l'instabilité institutionnelle ;
- * la communication entre les différents partenaires n'a pas été fluide entre les Ministères, d'abord entre le secrétariat permanent des opérations et les ministères, ensuite entre les coordonnateurs des ministères et les bénéficiaires ;
- * la disponibilité de la contrepartie ivoirienne en terme de trésorerie.

III.4. Les rôles respectifs des différents partenaires dans la sélection et l'utilisation de l'expertise extérieure dans le cadre du PAGRH.

Le choix des consultants a été dévolu à la Côte d'Ivoire. C'est ainsi que par exemple, la Direction de la Planification du ministère de l'Education a passé un contrat avec l'ENSEA. Mais il arrive que le bénéficiaire ne soit pas suffisamment outillé pour faire le choix.

Dans certains cas de consultations, (audits) il est précisé la nécessité d'expertise extérieure. De l'avis de la Banque Mondiale, cela relève de la recherche d'un regard plus libre et plus objectif qui ne pouvait venir de l'extérieur afin de garantir l'indépendance des consultants.

III.5. Recommandations

Par rapport aux actions qui ont freiné l'exécution du PAGRH, l'atelier a recommandé :

Au titre de la communication: la mise en place de courrier électronique au niveau de l'administration pour la communication tant au niveau interne qu'avec l'extérieur ;

Au titre du budget:

- * la planification des activités, de manière à gérer rationnellement l'existant ;
- * la mise en place des conditions des réaffectations des ressources budgétaires à des activités supposées prioritaires ;
- * la prévision dans le budget des Ministères, d'un fonds de préinvestissement pour l'exécution des plans d'action.

Au titre de la pérennisation des projets , outre ce qui précède :

- * une plus grande stabilité des responsables de projets;
- * l'élaboration des manuels de procédure;
- * la diffusion des rapports relatifs aux projets.

III.6. Analyse critique de l'utilisation de l'expertise extérieure pendant l'exécution du PAGRH

Le contexte dans lequel le PAGRH a été élaboré montre qu'il s'agit d'un projet pour la promotion et la vulgarisation du concept de transfert de compétence. Cet objectif a-t-il été atteint ? Dans certains cas oui. Avec l'exemple des Ecoles Témoins ou encore d'autres Directions Centrales. Dans d'autres cas par contre, le constat fait état de blocage.

Dans le premier cas, comme facteurs favorables il y a eu :

- * l'attitude de l'administration;
- * l'ouverture d'esprit de l'expert;
- * la disponibilité de l'homologue;
- * la volonté d'appropriation du Projet par l'homologue.

Dans le second cas, le transfert des compétences n'a pas été effectif pour les raisons suivantes :

- * l'instabilité au niveau de la hiérarchie de l'administration;
- * le profil des homologues ne correspondant pas toujours à la description du poste;
- * le peu de considération pour l'homologue;
- * le manque de contrôle de l'expert par l'administration;
- * la mauvaise utilisation de l'expert (ex : comme conseiller technique);
- * la rétention de l'information par l'expert;
- * le mauvais choix ou incompétence avéré de certains experts.

Dans le non transfert des compétences, les responsabilités sont partagées. La forme expert/homologues doit être maintenue et développée.

III.7. Pour atteindre les objectifs recherchés l'atelier a recommandé :

- 1) la désignation de l'homologue avant l'arrivée de l'expert afin qu'il se familiarise avec le projet et qu'il commence la mobilisation des acteurs.
- 2) la motivation des homologues (Intéressement, stages, formation complémentaire par rapport au profil de carrière)
- 3) le choix conséquent de l'homologue (Profil adapté à l'occupation naturelle)
- 4) le maintien de l'homologue jusqu'à la fin du projet.
- 5) le travail en étroite collaboration du responsable du service bénéficiaire, de l'homologue et de l'Assistance Technique.
- 6) une évaluation périodique du travail de l'Expert par le service utilisateur.
- 7) la prise de dispositions nécessaires pour la pérennisation des acquis du projet. (exemple : Rendre accessible la documentation et les outils développés à la faveur du projet ; Faire en sorte que l'homologue soit reconnu et utilisé comme un expert national).
- 8) la prise en compte de cette fonction dans la Promotion de l'homologue.

IV EVALUATION ECONOMIQUE ET FINANCIERE DU PROJET

IV. 1 Coût total du projet :

Initialement programmé sur 3 ans (1994 – 1996), le crédit IDA d'un montant de 4,7 millions de DTS a été exécuté sur 4 ans (1994 – 1997). Si on y ajoute la durée d'exécution des travaux préparatoires financés sur le PPF (1993), on peut estimer la durée totale d'exécution du PAGRH à 5 ans. L'allocation des ressources par catégorie de dépenses montre une prédominance des services de consultants (plus de 55%) suivi des études (près de 25%).

IV. 2 Pertes subies par l'effet de la prolongation du projet par projet (4 ans au lieu de 3 ans initialement prévus) :

L'exécution du projet sur 4 ans au lieu de 3 n'a pas causé de préjudices particuliers à la ligne de crédit.

Quant à la mobilisation des fonds de contrepartie elle a souffert des difficultés de trésorerie de l'Etat sur la période.

IV. 3 Coûts récurrents engendrés par le projet sur les secteurs bénéficiaires.

Parmi les activités du projet dont la poursuite après l'achèvement du projet nécessitait une prise en charge par le budget de l'Etat figuraient l'animation et le fonctionnement du réseau des Ecoles-Témoins et l'entretien du matériel et des équipements (matériel informatique, véhicules, etc.).

La prise en charge de l'entretien du matériel et des équipements a été confiée systématiquement aux services bénéficiaires à qui il revient de prévoir dans le cadre de leur budget de fonctionnement normal les ressources nécessaires.

Concernant le réseau d'Ecoles Témoins, cette précaution n'a pas été prise au titre de l'exercice budgétaire de 1998.

IV. 4 Conséquences prévisibles de la fin du projet sur les structures institutionnelles mises en place dans le cadre du projet.

Pour les besoins de réalisation du PVRH (et par la suite du PAGRH), le Gouvernement a mis en place le Comité des Opérations doté d'un Secrétariat Permanent et des sous comités ministériels. Après l'achèvement du projet, le Secrétariat Permanent a été intégré dans l'organigramme du Secrétariat Général du Ministère de l'Economie et des Finances pour assurer les fonctions de coordination des politiques sociales avec un accent particulier sur la surveillances des allocations de ressources aux secteurs sociaux. Quant aux sous comités ministériels, formés des Directions techniques dans chaque Ministère, leur pérennisation ne constituait pas un objectif en soit.

V RESUME DES PRINCIPALES CONCLUSIONS ET FUTURES OPERATIONS

V. 1 Enseignements principaux de l'exécution du projet

Sur le plan positif, l'assistance technique apportée aux Ministères a servi à concevoir et mettre en œuvre des réformes importantes et à leur donner une réelle capacité de suivi, de programmation et de gestion des moyens mis à leur disposition, tout en améliorant leur utilisation.

Les services bénéficiaires ont fait preuve de créativité et d'initiative dans l'utilisation du fonds de pré-investissement. Ce qui aurait pu être un facteur de blocage a été un avantage. La gestion interministérielle, sous l'égide du MEF, a assuré l'accès à toutes les composantes et un fonctionnement moins lourd.

Sur le plan négatif, on retiendra les changements institutionnels entraînant le renouvellement fréquent des Directeurs d'administration centrale et l'absence d'un manuel d'exécution.

V. 2 Futures opérations et pérennité

Pour la santé, la mise en place de la capacité de gestion au MSP, ainsi que le recouvrement des coûts ont permis de développer les services de santé primaire, dans le

cadre du PDSSI.

Pour l'éducation, les discussions avec la Banque et les autres partenaires ont conduit à l'adoption du PNDEF. La Banque prépare actuellement avec le Gouvernement un projet d'appui à l'enseignement de base, qui devrait permettre, grâce à une meilleure planification et programmation budgétaire de la part du MENFB, d'assurer à la fois une meilleure efficacité du système et son expansion au profit des enfants défavorisés.

Dans l'ensemble, il sera nécessaire d'apporter aux services bénéficiaires un soutien pour la modernisation et l'amélioration de leurs outils et procédures de gestion et de programmation.

V. 3 Leçons pour les futurs projets en Côte d'Ivoire

La réalisation de futurs projets dans les secteurs des Ressources Humaines devrait être au préalable assurée d'une bonne compréhension des enjeux et des objectifs par les équipes des Directeurs des Ministères.

Dans le cas d'une coordination interministérielle, l'équipe de coordination et de gestion devra être en mesure d'informer au jour le jour chaque nouvel arrivant sur le projet et de motiver ses partenaires au sein des autres Ministères.

Le recours à l'expertise extérieure (nationale et internationale) peut être bénéfique à l'Administration, pour peu que les résultats attendus soient clairement établis avec un calendrier des étapes et le détail des responsabilités dès la formulation des termes de référence.